

**PLANNING COMMISSION
CITY OF ST. GEORGE
WASHINGTON COUNTY, UTAH
March 11, 2014 – 5:00 PM**

MINUTES APPROVED
By: RO WILKINSON
Seconded: JULIE HULLINGER
Date: 5/13/14

PRESENT: Commissioner Julie Hullinger
Commissioner Ross Taylor
Commissioner Ro Wilkinson
Commissioner Diane Adams

CITY STAFF: Community Development Coordinator Bob Nicholson
Planner I Craig Harvey
Planner II Ray Snyder
Project Manager Todd Jacobsen
Assistant City Attorney Victoria Hales
Administrative Secretary Genna Singh

EXCUSED: Commissioner Nathan Fisher
Commissioner Todd Staheli
Commissioner Don Buehner
Council Member Joe Bowcutt
Deputy City Attorney Paula Houston
Development Services Manager Wes Jenkins

MEETING WELCOME

Commissioner Ross Taylor called the meeting to order at 5:02 pm.
Commissioner Ross Taylor explained that the Planning Commission has three new members who have replaced commissioners whose terms had expired.
Commissioner Ross Taylor noted that Item 1, PC Business, to elect a new chair and vice chair will be postponed until the next meeting when more commissioners are present.

FLAG SALUTE

Commissioner Ross Taylor led the salute to the flag.

Commissioner Ross Taylor explained that due to a shortage of commissioners on stand any motion tonight must be unanimous. Items on agenda tonight can proceed or wait to present at a later date as they see fit.

Commissioner Ross Taylor noted that an acting chair with authorization to sign the final plats for tonight's meeting is to be established.

<p>MOTION: Commissioner Julie Hullinger made a motion for Commissioner Ross Taylor to serve as acting chair and authorize to sign.</p>

SECOND: Commissioner Ro Wilkinson seconded the motion.

AYES (4)

Commissioner Diane Adams

Commissioner Ross Taylor

Commissioner Julie Hullinger

Commissioner Ro Wilkinson

NAYS (0)

Motion passes.

Acting Chair Ross Taylor explained that Item 5, Preliminary Plat for Tuscan Hills, has been pulled from the agenda and that Item 4C will be heard briefly but will again be tabled.

Bob Nicholson approached to confirm that Item 4C will be tabled to allow the applicant to submit a traffic impact study and elevations but an update will be given on the Item.

1. **PC BUSINESS**

A. Welcome three (3) new Planning Commission members.

B. Elect a PC Chairman and Vice Chairman.

Acting Chair Ross Taylor noted that PC Business has been taken care of for tonight.

2. **PUBLIC TRANSIT SHELTER**

Consider a reduced setback to allow installation of a small pedestrian shelter near the existing crosswalk on Foremaster Drive for IHC (Intermountain Healthcare). Case No. 2014-RS-001. (Staff – Bob N.)

Bob Nicholson presented the following:

The shelter is approximately the size of some bus shelters found around town. It will serve as a protection for pedestrians from the rain, heat, or cold for those waiting to cross. The shelter can be placed in the setback area subject to approval from the Planning Commission, City Council and property owner.

In 10-14-9 it states: *public transit shelters, with or without public restrooms, may be located within a setback area adjacent to a public street, subject to approval by the planning commission, city council and property owner.*

We felt this was very similar to a public transit shelter. The shelter would be approximately six (6) feet behind the sidewalk and would be temporary. It will be there anywhere from six (6) months to two (2) years until the tunnel at the wash is complete as a pedestrian underpass. There are representatives from IHC here tonight to field questions if you have any.

Mike Bench approached and stated he is here to answer questions.

Acting Chair Ross Taylor asked how long this temporary shelter will be there.

Mike Bench said it will be there until the underground tunnel is complete.

MOTION: Commissioner Ro Wilkinson made a motion to accept Item 2 for a shelter.
SECONDED: Commissioner Diane Adams seconded the motion.

AYES (4)

Commissioner Diane Adams

Acting Chair Ross Taylor

Commissioner Julie Hullinger

Commissioner Ro Wilkinson

NAYS (0)

Motion carries.

3. **FINAL PLATS (FP)**

- A. Consider approval of a final plat for “**Estates at Hidden Valley Phase 7**” an eighteen (18) lot residential subdivision plat. The representative is Mr. Bob Hermandson, Bush & Gudgell. The property is zoned PD-R (Planned Development Residential) and is located at approximately Athens Drive and Rome Drive (Hidden Valley area at approximately 200 E 3550 S). Case No. 2013-FP-081. (Staff – Todd J.)
- B. Consider approval of a final plat for “**Estates at Hidden Valley Phase 8**” a twenty (20) lot residential subdivision plat. The representative is Mr. Bob Hermandson, Bush & Gudgell. The property is zoned PD-R (Planned Development Residential) and is located at approximately Lake Placid Drive and Rome Drive (Hidden Valley area at approximately 350 E 3535 S). Case No. 2013-FP-082. (Staff – Todd J.)
- C. Consider approval of a final plat for “**Meadow Valley Farms Phase 8**” a two (2) lot residential subdivision plat. The representative is Mr. Brad Peterson, Development Solutions. The property is zoned RE-20 (Residential Estate 20,000 square foot minimum lot size) and is located at approximately 3910 South and Bentley Road (Little Valley area). Case No. 2014-FP-070. (Staff – Todd J.)
- D. Consider approval of a final plat for “**Mulberry Estates Phase 5**” a seventeen (17) lot residential subdivision plat. The representative is Mr. Roger Bundy, R&B Surveying. The property is zoned RE-20 (Residential Estate 20,000 square foot minimum lot size) lots 76 – 78 and R-1-12 (Single Family Residential 12,000 square foot minimum lot size) lots 69-75 and 79-85 and is located at approximately 3150 South and 2880 East (Little Valley area). Case No. 2014-FP-073. (Staff – Todd J.)
- E. Consider approval of a final plat for “**Sun River St George Phase 37**” a fourteen (14) lot residential subdivision plat. The representative is Mr. Brandon Anderson, Rosenberg Associates. The property is zoned PD-R (Planned Development Residential) and is located at approximately English Ivy Drive and White Stone drive (Sun River development at approximately 1600 West and 5170 South). Case No. 2013-FP-058. (Staff – Todd J.)

- F. Consider approval of a final plat for “**Sun River St George Phase 38**” a fourteen (14) lot residential subdivision plat. The representative is Mr. Brandon Anderson, Rosenberg Associates. The property is zoned PD-R (Planned Development Residential) and is located at approximately Pearl Vista and White Stone Drive (Sun River development at approximately 1430 West and 5140 South). Case No. 2013-FP-057. (Staff – Todd J.)
- G. Consider approval of a final plat for “**Sun River St George Phase 39**” an eleven (11) lot residential subdivision plat. The representative is Mr. Brandon Anderson, Rosenberg Associates. The property is zoned PD-R (Planned Development Residential) and is located at approximately Pearl Vista Drive and Silk Berry Circle (Sun River development at approximately 1400 West and 5180 South). Case No. 2013-FP-059. (Staff – Todd J.)

Todd Jacobsen presented the above listed items. There were no additional comments from Todd on any of the above listed.

Commissioner Ro Wilkinson asked about developing near the cul-de-sac on item 3G. Todd Jacobsen responded that they cannot really develop there as they are at the boundary.

MOTION: Commissioner Julie Hullinger made a motion to approve items 3A – 3G and authorize chairman to sign.
SECONDED: Commissioner Ro Wilkinson seconded the motion.
AYES (4)
Commissioner Diane Adams
Acting Chair Ross Taylor
Commissioner Julie Hullinger
Commissioner Ro Wilkinson
NAYS (0)
Motion carries.

4. **ZONE CHANGE (ZC) - PUBLIC HEARING (5:00 P.M.)**

- A. Consider a zone change request from R-1-10 (Single Family Residential 10,000 sq. ft. minimum lot size) to C2 (Highway Commercial) for the “**Medical Dialysis**” professional building. The project contains approximately 1.86 acres and is located at approximately 650 South 1000 East. The applicant is the Coaction Group and the representative is Mr. Don Wieser. Case No. 2014-ZC-005 (Staff Ray S.)

Ray Snyder presented the following:

If approved tonight, staff will then see a Site Plan Review (Civil Engineering Plans). They are asking to go to C2 and not a planned development, but we are still requesting they submit the site plan and elevations. It is proposed to be one story with the building in the center. There is a narrative in the packet that I will touch on briefly.

On the second page of the narrative they talk about the building appearance: *The building form will be segmented into different planes, heights and textured materials to provide architectural interest. The massing at the entry will provide weather protection for patient drop off. Expanses of glass will be screen from late afternoon sun. The rear of the building will be designed to provide a second front of building look. . .*

Acting Chair Ross Taylor asked if there was a typo in the packet stating that the entrance is at 1000 South rather than 1000 East.

Don Wieser (applicant) responded that Ross is correct; the entrance will be at 1000 East.

Ray Snyder noted that if approved that will be edited before heading to Council.

Ray Snyder continued to address the narrative noting that it is written that they will have Site Walls (monument sign) which is not part of the approval tonight. That would be a staff approval for signage. They also talk about vehicular circulation and it looks like it will work well. The renderings have a lot of articulation and pop outs. All four sides have been submitted. Mr. Wieser can address the building itself and the need for it.

Don Wieser approached to add:

It is a 1-story building. We plan on a 24 station dialysis center at the southern half of the facility. The northern half of the facility will be the clinic itself. The porte-cochere at the front is all covered to protect patients and those dropping them off from the elements and to provide easy access to the building. Then entrance will be a lobby where you can choose to go to the clinic or center. The building will be a wood frame structure. We're still working on the design but we foresee using a structure made of stucco with some stonework near the entry and a possible metal façade. The back of the building will be as attractive as possible.

Commissioner Ro Wilkinson noted that it doesn't look like there is room for expansion and asked if 24 seats will be the maximum.

Don Wieser responded that the 24 seats is all the facility is designed for.

Assistant City Attorney Victoria Hales reminded the commissioners that tonight's request is just a zone change. Any subsequent owner can change the building to accommodate any approved C2 use.

MOTION: Commissioner Ro Wilkinson made a motion to recommend approval of Item 4A the zone change for dialysis.

*****Bob Nicholson reminded the Commissioners that this is a public hearing item.*****

Acting Chair Ross Taylor opened the item to the public for comments.

There were no comments.

Acting Chair Ross Taylor closed the item to the public and opened the item up for discussion among commissioners.

MOTION: Commissioner Ro Wilkinson made a motion to approve Item 4A.

SECONDED: Commissioner Diane Adams seconded the motion.

AYES (4)

Commissioner Diane Adams

Acting Chair Ross Taylor

Commissioner Julie Hullinger

Commissioner Ro Wilkinson

NAYS (0)

Motion carries.

- B. Consider a zone change request from RE-20 (Residential Estates 20,000 sq. ft. minimum lot size) to R-1-10 (Single Family Residential 10,000 sq. ft. minimum lot size) on a 4.409 acre parcel. The property is generally located southwest of the intersection of Crimson Ridge Drive and Little Valley Road and west of Sun Valley Estates subdivision. The project will be known as “**Crimson Cove**.” The applicant is Bar S Properties. The representative is Mr. Zach Renstrom with Bush & Gudgell. Case No. 2014-ZC-004 (Staff–Craig H.).

Craig Harvey presented the following:

This property is divided into two general plan designations. The first is Rural Residential. That is a buffer created by the Planning Commission and City Council a few years ago that was intended to connect the two horse subdivisions north and south of this. That buffer requires that all properties in that buffer must maintain two (2) dwelling units per acre or less.

They are asking for R-1-10 for the entire parcel however staff recommends that there is a condition added that the 200’ buffer be met and that the properties that front Little Valley road maintain that two (2) lots per acre or less essentially the ½ acre lots or greater to meet the requirement.

Assistant City Attorney Victoria Hales again reminded the commissioners that tonight’s request is just a zone change. Any subsequent owner would be able to use the R-1-10 zoning throughout.

Craig Harvey added that the applicant is looking to change the entire lot, but a portion of the lot is currently RE-20 which fits the requirement so that part of the parcel could remain zoned as is and then just re-zone the other portion of the parcel as R-1-10.

MOTION: Commissioner Julie Hullinger made a motion to approve Item 4B and include staff comments that the Rural Residential, ½ acre lots be maintained for the 200’ so those lots must be platted as ½ acre or greater.

DISCUSSION ON THE MOTION:

Bob added that the clearest thing to do would be to make it stay as RE-20 on that part of the parcel and then the other part can rezone to R-1-10.

Acting Chair Ross Taylor asked Bob what City Council’s position is with RE-20 properties and

maintaining animal rights.

Bob Nicholson responded that it is site specific. There is not a blanket statement. In this case, the buffer along Little Valley Road is to connect the equestrian areas to the north and south.

Acting Chair Ross Taylor commented that if the surrounding property has animal rights, a way to quiet the people there would be to grant animal rights to all around there.

Bob Nicholson responded when zoning adjacent to animal rights property that is part of the philosophy but it's all site specific.

Craig Harvey reminded the commission that this is a public hearing item.

Acting Chair Ross Taylor opened the item to the public.

Zach Renstrom (applicant):

We would like to keep it all one zoning because it is easier on the title report. It's not a major issue. No matter what, we have to keep that 200' setback it just gives us more flexibility.

Acting Chair Ross Taylor closed the item to the public.

MOTION: Commissioner Julie Hullinger moved to maintain her motion to approve with the 200' buffer of RE-20 on that section.

SECONDED: Commissioner Ro Wilkinson seconded the motion.

AYES (3)

Commissioner Diane Adams

Commissioner Julie Hullinger

Commissioner Ro Wilkinson

NAYS (1)

Acting Chair Ross Taylor

Motion denied.

No action was taken by the Planning Commission.

Acting Chair Ross Taylor stated that the item is to come back when there is a full commission.

- C. Consider a zone change request from R-1-10 (Single Family Residential 10,000 sq. ft. minimum lot size) to PD-C (Planned Development Commercial) for "**Boulder Creek Commons**" and "**Boulder Creek Crossings.**" The project site contains approximately 30.05 acres of land and is located in the vicinity of the intersection of River Road and 1450 South. The applicant is Shefco and the representative is Rosenberg Associates. Case No. 2014-ZC-001 (Staff – Bob N.).

Note 1: this item was tabled for 30 days at the January 21, 2014 PC meeting. The applicant was encouraged to 1) form and meet with a neighborhood committee, and 2) label the buildings on the plan and state the criteria associated with each one.

Note 2: On February 18, 2014, the applicant asked to delay the item returning to PC until the March 11, 2014 meeting.

Bob Nicholson approached to present the following update:

Again, this item will be continued at a later date. A revised site plan has been submitted. When this came in initially, the Smith's Marketplace was not part of the change. At that time it was tabled for neighborhood meetings and such. Both the City and the neighbors have suggested that rather than looking at this piecemeal we look at the entire thing. The grocery anchor store is labeled as Smith's however they have not committed to the parcel. The issues we need more information on are definitely traffic with an anchor store as well as the other units. Access points need to be looked at. The 2004 Traffic Impact Study that was done is dated and needs to be redone. Steve will bring a traffic consultant on board. We also need renderings for the entire project as Planned Development (PD) zones need those. The smaller buildings have been submitted but the anchor store has not, particularly the front and rear. The rear of the anchor store would also need a noise mitigation plan. So those three items are what we are looking for. We will continue it and the public can come back when those items are available.

Steve Sheffield approached:

We have been working on this property since the 1960s. The property was designated as a neighborhood center in the 1980s. As requested by the City we helped develop the road and other improvements in that area which has been a huge sacrifice for our family.

The renderings are not in for Smith's because they have not given them to us. Because they have not made the commitment, we didn't want to propose their site. It is still unknown but we show Smith's in the master plan as a concession to the neighbors. As we went through the neighborhood meetings the vast majority was terribly excited. The immediate neighbors are still not keen to having it in their backyard. The more the neighbors learn about it the more acceptable and desirable it turns out to be.

The traffic issues are still unknown and if Smith's continues to wait we may have to change which store goes in there. One thing we could do is go on with the Smith's there OR we can move forward with it not there. Regardless we need to move forward with the rest of the master plan. We do have issues with the traffic. We do need two (2) entrances off of River Road. Although the 2004 traffic impact study did take in account the shopping center, it only had one entrance on River Road rather than two. For that reason we will table it for now until we get more answers. We'll decide if we need to leave Smith's or if we'll proceed with Smith's without their commitment.

Acting Chair Ross Taylor asked Mr. Sheffield if he has an estimation of when the remaining items would be submitted.

Steve Sheffield responded that it would take some time to come up with the \$10,000 to complete the traffic impact study since money has been spent on road improvements and other things. It will be at least a month but it could be longer if we cannot come up with the funds. We may have to start phasing the project.

Bob Nicholson asked that there be an official motion to continue the Item until all the information has been provided.

MOTION: Commissioner Diane Adams made a motion to table until the applicant is ready to bring it forward.

SECONDED: Commissioner Julie Hullinger seconded the motion.

AYES (4)

Commissioner Diane Adams

Acting Chair Ross Taylor

Commissioner Julie Hullinger

Commissioner Ro Wilkinson

NAYS (0)

Motion carries.

5. **PRELIMINARY PLAT (PP)**

Consider approval of a preliminary plat for “**Tuscan Hills Phase 5**” a twenty-eight (28) lot residential subdivision. The applicant is Updwell Development, LLC and the representative is Mr. Todd Gardner with Alpha Engineering. The property is zoned R-1-10 (Single Family Residential, 10,000 sq. ft. minimum lot size) and is located at the intersection of Plantations Drive and Dixie Drive. Case No. 2014-PP-014 (Staff – Wes J.).

Bob Nicholson approached to explain why Item 5 has been tabled:

There was a project approved in 2004 for this area. There are two reasons for the tabling. Because this is a PD with open space and common areas, they need to be dedicated either to the City or HOA concurrently as development proceeds. With this plat we need the common area to be brought in. Secondly, the applicant and developer showed two amenities. Neither has been built and we’re leery because there is different ownership amongst the parcels compiling the project. We want to know the proposal for the amenities or if the applicant wants to abandon them we need to do an amended PD with a public hearing.

6. **CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT (CUP)**

Consider a request to construct a detached accessory (gazebo) structure to a height of 22 feet high. The property is located at 3394 East 2000 South. The applicant is Mr. Jared Wittwer. The representative is Mr. Austin Anderson of Aj Construction. Case No. 2014-CUP-004 (Staff – Craig H.)

Craig Harvey presented the following:

There has been a site plan submitted. The gazebo will be part of the pool house complex of the property. The zoning is A-1 so there is not a code in that section that deals with accessory structures. However, Title 14 does have code that applies to the zone that for height requirement.

The code reads (10-14-13a): *Additional Height Allowed: Buildings and structures...may be erected to a height greater than the height of 15’ subject to conditional use recommendation by the planning commission and approval by the city council.*

10-14-13d reads: *Maximum Height Of Accessory Building: No building which is accessory to a one-family, two-family, three-family or four-family dwellings shall be erected to a height greater than one story or fifteen feet (15').*

Section D says maximum of 15' but Section A says they can with approval which is why we're here tonight. The proposed structure will be 22' tall. The applicant wants to match the home. The surrounding is all single family and agricultural zoning.

The proposed structure will be located in the rear yard approximately seventy feet (70') from the main dwelling and sixty-two feet (62') from the rear property line and fifty feet (50') from the side property line. The detached structure will be used primarily as a gazebo. There will be a small enclosed storage area in the gazebo. The detached structure will have the same finishes as the existing home and similar colors.

Staff recommends approval. As for the findings that are applicable:

Aesthetics – it will match.

Height – the gazebo will be 22'.

Character – it does fit into an Agricultural zone. Towers and barns and such are allowed in this area so it does fit the character.

Acting Chair Ross Taylor reminded the commissioners to refer to the specific findings in the motion.

MOTION: Commissioner Ro Wilkinson made a motion to accept the Conditional Use Permit for building height with the discussion of the reported findings D, G, and J of the staff report.

SECONDED: Commissioner Julie Hullinger seconded the motion.

AYES (4)

Commissioner Diane Adams

Acting Chair Ross Taylor

Commissioner Julie Hullinger

Commissioner Ro Wilkinson

NAYS (0)

Motion carries.

7. BUILDING DESIGN CONCEPTUAL SITE PLAN (BDCSP)

Consider a request for a BDCSP (Building Design Conceptual Site Plan) review of a proposed seventy-eight (78) unit Estancia Resort Condominiums at Green Valley. The site is located on Plantations Drive between the Trendwest Vacation Rental development and the Cottage South development. The zoning is PD-R (Planned Development Residential). The representative is Mr. David Nasal. Case No. 2014-BDCSP-001. (staff – Bob N.)

Bob Nicholson presented the following:

Back when the mesa was first developed as a Planned Development we didn't get the site plan for some parcels so we are looking at it now. There are four buildings with an interior courtyard and parking on the perimeter will access on Plantations Drive. Currently Plantations Drive terminates at the end of their property. Eventually it will tie in the Dixie Drive. The building covers 1.24 acres, with a 4-story building in the middle and will have 78 units. Parking code, including guest parking, is met. The exterior building materials consist of tile roofs, textured stucco walls, and stone accents on the columns. The building will have some architectural interest. The landscape requirement will be a minimum of 30% and they have shown 38% on their site plan. They meet the 182 parking spaces required. As part of the open space and landscape area there is a recreation area requirement 200 square feet per unit. They need 15,600 square feet and they meet with the courtyard. In brief, staff feels that it meets the requirements. If there were any suggestions we would ask for more accents but that is up to you to consider.

Dwayne (applicant's representative) – We've met with the neighbors to the west of us at the Cottages as well as Green Valley Spa. We have not had any opposition. We have received neighborhood input for the wall. We have not changed our planned number of units from the zone change earlier this year. There are four buildings total. These are individual condos. These units will have separate tax ids and will typically be second homes or vacation rentals.

MOTION: Commissioner Ro Wilkinson made a motion to accept Item 7 for Estancia Resort Condos in Green Valley.

SECONDED: Commissioner Julie Hullinger seconded the motion.

AYES (4)

Commissioner Diane Adams

Acting Chair Ross Taylor

Commissioner Julie Hullinger

Commissioner Ro Wilkinson

NAYS (0)

Motion carries.

8. TRAINING – SPRING CONFERENCE

Active Planning Commissioners are invited and encouraged to attend the 2014 UTAPA (Utah American Planning Association) Spring Conference to be held in Springdale Utah on April 3rd & 4th. The Friday session of the conference will have courses specifically for appointed City officials. Interested commissioners may contact Craig Harvey to discuss details and for registration assistance. Information attached to agenda.

Bob Nicholson approached to remind the commissioners about the upcoming UTAPA Conference. To sign up or if there are any questions commissioners are to contact Craig Harvey.

9. **MINUTES**

Consider approval of the minutes from January 21, 2014, February 11, 2014 and February 25, 2014.

January 21 proposed edits:

Acting Chair Ross Taylor noted that on page 34, comments from Wes Jenkins, the last sentence does not make sense.

February 11 proposed edits:

No edits were made.

February 25 proposed edits:

No edits were made.

MOTION: Commissioner Diane Adams made a motion to accept the minutes with the proposed edits.

SECONDED: Commissioner Julie Hullinger seconded the motion.

AYES (4)

Commissioner Diane Adams

Acting Chair Ross Taylor

Commissioner Julie Hullinger

Commissioner Ro Wilkinson

NAYS (0)

Motion carries.

ADJOURN

MOTION: Commissioner Julie Hullinger made a motion to adjourn.

SECONDED: Acting Chair Ross Taylor seconded the motion.

AYES (4)

Commissioner Diane Adams

Acting Chair Ross Taylor

Commissioner Julie Hullinger

Commissioner Ro Wilkinson

NAYS (0)

Meeting adjourned at 6:11 pm.